



E-government and Public Marketing: innovation in governments' strategies for Citizen Empowerment

Berlin, June 8th 2010

luca.buccoliero@unibocconi.it

elena.bellio@unibocconi.it



Customer & Service Science Lab Bocconi: mission

- The Customer & Service Science lab has been created at the end of 2006 thanks to a chair denominated Customer & Service Science sponsored by Mediolanum SpA.
- The Centre aims at developing research projects on the crucial themes of customer orientation and competitiveness in the service sectors.



Customer & Service Science Lab Bocconi: research areas

- Customer Orientation and Customer Centrality
- Innovation and Competitiveness
- Service Science
- Best Practices
- Healthcare and Public Service



Customer & Service Science Lab Bocconi: research projects 2010

- Patient empowerment in Healthcare
- Value for citizens: network of service innovation in local government



Agenda

- Trends in government marketing;
- Convergence of government marketing and E-government;
- Citizen Web Empowerment in MCE members' portals: a tool for benchmarking
- “Value for Citizen”: first results from MCE-Bocconi research



Trends in government marketing





Government marketing

- A marketing approach for Governments was criticized because:
 - Lack of classical market dynamics in public service delivery;
 - Marketing was considered just a tool to increase demand (not to balance demand and supply);
 - Marketing was considered a tool for political strategies.



Government marketing (2)

- In the Nineties, government marketing started to be considered a tool for external relationships management aimed to increase effectiveness and efficiency of government;
- Today, the key issue of government marketing is the **value creation for citizens** (customers)

Wrap up

- From the four “P” ...
 - Product;
 - Price;
 - Place;
 - Promotion.
- To the four “C”
 - Citizens’ needs and wants;
 - Cost to the citizen;
 - Convenience;
 - Communication



Convergence of Government Marketing and E-Government



Convergent trends

GOVERNMENT MARKETING

- 1990-2005
 - Focus: product/service
 - Objective increase in efficiency
- 2005-...
 - Focus: citizen/customer
 - Objective: value creation for citizen

E-GOV

- 1990-2006
 - Focus: ICT
 - Objective: increase of efficiency, savings
- 2006-...
 - Focus: Citizen/customer
 - Objective: effectiveness of services for citizens

2010: CITIZEN EMPOWERMENT

- Better understanding of citizens' value elements and “user experience” in on-line services
- Web 2.0 diffusion
- “Let e-government go into citizens' hands”: mobile government



Citizen Web Empowerment in MCE members' portals: a tool for benchmarking





Survey objective

- To understand and to measure the degree of citizen web empowerment in Local Governments' Portals
- To develop a first index for benchmarking of citizen empowerment through web portals (Citizen Web Empowerment Index)



The index is based on the following variables

➤ **E-information**

- » List of city politicians,
- » City Government structure displayed online
- » Policies and procedures (any) available online
- » Contact details (of any municipality official) available online
- » The budget is online
- » Legislation is online (availability of legislation online)

➤ **Tools 2.0**

- » Blogs on municipality website
- » Web forums / on-line bulletin boards on municipality website
- » Online newsletter on municipality website
- » Social networking: Facebook on municipality website
- » Social networking: Flickr/You Tube on municipality website
- » Social networking: Twitter on municipality website
- » One-stop shop portal for citizens to interact with the municipality
- » Mobile services

The index is based on the following variables (2)

➤ **E-consultation**

- » Internet petitions
- » Reputation systems
- » The Mayor has his own website
- » The Mayor website has a contact e-mail address or feedback form
- » The Mayor website responds to user requests
- » Elected officials have their own website
- » Elected officials (aside from the Mayor) have a contact e-mail address on his website
- » Elected officials (aside from the Mayor) website respond to user requests.

➤ **E-Decision Making Process**

- » Evidence to show that the municipality considers the opinions of citizens in decision making processes (eg: e-voting system, online polls)
- » Evidence to show that the municipality informs its citizens on what decisions it has arrived based on consultations (eg: publication of online polls/e-survey results and subsequent action taken)



42 web portals of
MCE members

➤ Research period:
march-may 2010

➤ Analysis and
rating of sites was
based on two
fundamental
criteria:

- » Immediacy in
traceability;
- » Systematic (as
opposed to
sporadic)
presence of
the
information.



Home About us Organizing Committee Area Newsletters Join Major Cities

About us >> Our Members

Our Members

<p>Switzerland Genève, Zürich</p>	<p>Italy Modena, Roma, Siena, Trieste, Venezia, Prato, Parma, Livorno, Bocconi University</p>
<p>Bosnia and Herzegovina Banjaluka</p>	<p>Croatia Zagreb, Rijeka</p>
<p>Denmark Aarhus, Copenhagen</p>	<p>Netherlands Den Haag, Zoetermeer</p>
<p>Germany Saarbrücken, Leipzig, Dortmund, Bremerhaven, Bremen, Hamburg, Berlin</p>	<p>Norway Oslo, Sarpsborg</p>
<p>Great Britain Birmingham, Belfast</p>	<p>Slovenia Koper, Ljubljana</p>
<p>France Paris, Lyon</p>	<p>Sweden Stockholm, Göteborg, Uppsala</p>
<p>Ireland Cork, Cork County Council, Dublin, DunLaoghaire/Rathdown, LGCSB</p>	<p>Austria Wien</p>
<p>Bulgaria Burgas</p>	<p>Spain Barcelona</p>
<p>USA Boston</p>	<p>Greece Trikala</p>
<p>ISRAEL Tel Aviv</p>	

printversion



➤ **Average CWEI in considered websites: 37,8/100**

» Average CWEI e-information: 74/100

» Average CWEI tools 2.0: 23,21/100

» Average CWEI e-consultation: 32,4/100

» Average CWEI e-decision making process: 8,3/100

➤ "TOP FIVE"

- Trikala
- Hamburg
- Wien
- Venice
- Tel Aviv

The screenshot shows the website for the Major Cities of Europe IT Users Group. At the top, there is a navigation menu with links: Home, About us, Organizing Committee Area, Newsletters, and Join Major Cities. Below this is a sub-menu with 'About us >> Our Members'. The main content area is titled 'Our Members' and lists various countries with their flags and associated cities. The countries listed are: Switzerland (Genève, Zürich), Italy (Modena, Roma, Siena, Trieste, Venezia, Prato, Parma, Livorno, Bocconi University), Bosnia and Herzegovina (Banjaluka), Croatia (Zagreb, Rijeka), Denmark (Aarhus, Copenhagen), Netherlands (Den Haag, Zoetermeer), Germany (Saarbrücken, Leipzig, Dortmund, Bremerhaven, Bremen, Hamburg, Berlin), Norway (Oslo, Sarpsborg), Great Britain (Birmingham, Belfast), Slovenia (Koper, Ljubljana), France (Paris, Lyon), Sweden (Stockholm, Göteborg, Uppsala), Ireland (Cork, Cork County Council, Dublin, DunLaoghaire/Rathdown, LGCSB), Austria (Wien), Bulgaria (Burgas), Spain (Barcelona), USA (Boston), Greece (Trikala), and ISRAEL (Tel Aviv). A 'printversion' icon is visible at the bottom right of the page.



Main conclusions of the survey

3 main kinds of considerations on the Web strategy of local governments

- substantial immaturity of web strategies, still modulated on structures and organizational responsibilities instead of on the needs and on the demand of citizens' empowerment;
- lack of awareness of the need to assume a role of active partner for citizens' through the web portals by strenghtening their level of empowerment and participation:
- Low penetration of 2.0 web tools and strategies and very limited diffusion of mobile applications (index mobile: 14,28/100)



“Value for Citizen”: first results from MCE-Bocconi research





Research questions

- The purpose of our work:
develop an evaluation model of the impacts of a Web 2.0 technology in the relationship between citizens and Local Governments, through citizen empowerment;
- The case study:
“Amministrare 2.0 – IRIS” (*Internet Reporting Information System*), an application developed by the Municipality of Venice - Italy;
- The research question:
What are the main impacts of IRIS project on three main dimensions
 - citizens’ trust?
 - municipality backoffice?
 - role of politicians?

Literature review (1)

- The scientific literature reports a significant variety of evaluative approaches for ICT: this suggests the complexity of appraising ICT investments.
- There are two distinct aspects of this.
 - First, the range of impact of ICT investments requires different evaluation tools to identify which factors play a role in the introduction of ICT: strategic priorities, tangible costs and benefits, intangible benefits, risks, flexibility, interactions between different ICT projects (i.e. complementarities).
 - Second, the diversity of interests and information needs of different stakeholders generates varying, but relevant viewpoints about the priority and impact of ICT investments.
- Therefore, both qualitative and quantitative aspects are normally part of the evaluation process.
- Hamilton and Chervany (1981) propose participatory evaluative approaches to incorporate multiple viewpoints and the use of standardized measures to make results comparable.



Literature review (2)

- Serafeimidis and Smithson (2003) define four possible ICT evaluation orientations: control, social learning, sense-making, exploratory. Each orientation emphasizes a particular role and, consequently, a different evaluation approach.
- Lemuria Carter and France Bélanger (2005) created a model to present those factors able to influence the level of adoption of e-government initiatives by citizens.
- Through research carried out on the websites of 35 large European cities, Lourdes Torres, Vincente Pina and Basilio Acerete (2006) showed how most services offered on-line are not interactive, in terms of e-service, nor participatory in terms of e-democracy.
- David Brown (2005) shows how e-government affects the relationships between citizens, Public Administration and political representatives. The author underlines a significant fact: through innovative e-government activities, politicians fear a decline in the importance of their own role.

Amministrare 2.0

- “Amministrare 2.0” project has been developed taking inspiration from the Web 2.0 philosophy.
- The objective is to overcome the digital divide, by promoting the right to “digital citizenship”.

- IRIS (Internet Reporting Information System) :
 - a software designed to allow citizens to report needs in a given area;
 - was introduced in May 2008 and, until early 2009, ran only on Venice's Lido (approx. 30,000 inhabitants);



- it is based on the interaction between the city cartography, Public Works data and the databases of the public utilities;
- through web access to a dedicated section in IRIS (<http://iris.comune.venezia.it/>), the user can indicate ("tag") the reported problem on a map of the city and attach a photograph with the report;
- the user can choose between 16 alternative issues, each of which is sent to specific recipients according to their relative competencies;
- the Municipality and/or the appointed maintenance department are obliged to respond to the citizen and indicate the feasibility and estimated time for the resolution of the problem. The change of status of the report is visible on the web.



Cognome:

BELLIO *

Nome:

ELENA *

Telefono:

041992157 *

e-mail (per info sulla segnalazione):

elenabellio@libero.it

Indirizzo di residenza:

via roma 5

Tipologia di problema:

Strade (buche, dissesti) ▼

Oggetto:

tombino *

Indicazioni utili:

di fronte alla tabaccheria
il tombino non risulta
fissato al suolo

Consento di visualizzare il mio
nome e cognome:

- Affissioni selvagge
 - Barriere architettoniche
 - Canali/Rii
 - Deiezioni animali
 - Graffiti
 - Illuminazione pubblica
 - Paline danneggiate
 - Paline naviganti
 - Parcheggi/Ormezzi selvaggi
 - Scarico abusivo di rifiuti
 - Segnaletica stradale
 - Servizi igienici
 - Strade (buche, dissesti)
 - Veicoli abbandonati
 - Verde pubblico
 - Altro
- (Selezionare) ▼

Segnalazioni via MMS.

- Segnalazione pervenute via MMS.
- **Invia** la tua segnalazione con foto e testo al numero 338-6400894.

Lista delle segnalazioni pervenute mediante MMS al numero 338-6400894.

Oggetto	Ricevuta il	Immagine	Testo
Fwd:	01/09/2008 08.40.40		Gabinetti sempre chiusi !patrizia



1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 ... >>

Oggetto	Nr.	Tipo problema	Arrivata il	Segnalatore	Rif / Tempi	Stato
 colonnine enel divelte 	477	Altro	22/09/2008	xxxx	Iris Room	Ricevuta
 sito itis e mms 	476	Altro	20/09/2008	DE PIETRI PATRIZIA	Iris Room	Ricevuta
 Mancanza di parcheggio 	475	Parcheggi/Ormezzi selvaggi	19/09/2008	xxxx	Polizia Municipale	Ricevuta
 strada dissestata 	474	Strade (buche, dissesti)	19/09/2008	xxxx	Municipalità Lido-Pellestrina	Ricevuta
 impossibilità agli alunni di accedere alla scuola 	473	Altro	18/09/2008	xxxx	Iris Room	Ricevuta
 re-installazione segnaletica 	472	Segnaletica stradale	18/09/2008	BATTISTINI ARRIGO		Chiusa
 Pini marittimi Lgm Marconi 	471	Verde pubblico	18/09/2008	xxxx	Veritas	In carico
 Asilo Don Bosco 	470	Strade (buche, dissesti)	18/09/2008	xxxx	Municipalità Lido-Pellestrina	Ricevuta
 Alberi pendenti sul marciapiede 	469	Altro	18/09/2008	xxxx	Iris Room	Ricevuta
 prato da ripiantare a Malamocco 	468	Verde pubblico	18/09/2008	xxxx	Veritas	In carico
 sfalcio erba e pulizia strada 	467	Verde pubblico	18/09/2008	xxxx		Chiusa
 tombini che non scaricano 	466	Altro	17/09/2008	xxxx	Insula	In carico

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 ... >>



Research methodology (1)

- Our study is focused on IRIS project;
- The main features of the software and of the parties involved in using it were analysed by considering the total amount of transactions occurred;
- Three kinds of impacts have been considered:
 - 1) The impacts of IRIS on citizens' trust and relationship with Local Government;
 - 2) The impact of IRIS on Local Government's back-office organizational processes;
 - 3) The impact of IRIS on the role of politicians.

Research methodology (2)

1) The impacts of IRIS on citizens' trust and relationship with Local Government:

- citizens were divided into two groups:
 - those using the IRIS software at least once;
 - those who report incidents using traditional off-line systems, going personally to the Public Relations Office (PRO).
- a questionnaire was drawn up for each category: the one addressed to those who do not use IRIS was distributed on paper within the PRO, while the second was compiled on-line at the end of the IRIS procedure;
- a statistic analysis was carried out:
 - the percentages of the demographic data were calculated to identify the main characteristics of the people using an on-line service or the off-line one;
 - for the answers on a scale of 1 to 5 the mean was calculated.
- through XLMiner, an Excel plug in, the association technique was used to extract useful information from the available set of data.

Research methodology (3)

2) The impact of IRIS on Local Government's back-office organizational processes:

- semi-structured interviews were delivered to a group of civil servants of the Lido Municipality, who have seen changes in their own jobs as a result of the introduction of the IRIS software.

3) The impact of IRIS on the role of politicians:

- a focus group was organised, involving the politicians who promoted this initiative: the Vice Mayor and some of his close collaborators.

Results (1)

1) The impacts of IRIS on citizens' trust and relationship with Local Government:

- Some differences between the groups of citizens were identified:

Gender:

- On-line users: a prevalence of men;
- Off-line users: a prevalence of women.

Age:

- On-line users: a presence of young people is recorded, aged mostly between 26 and 45 with only 6% of people aged over 65;
- Off-line users: the prevalent age was between 46 and 65, and the percentage of those aged over 65 was 27%.

Education:

- On-line users: higher (1/2 have a high school leaving certificate, and 1/4 a university qualification. There are no individuals with primary level education);
- Off-line users: lower (primary level education counts for 5%).

Work status:

- On-line users: lack of pensioners;
- Off-line users: 26% of pensioners.

The possibility of an internet connection at home, and the type of connection:

- the percentage of those who do not have their own connection is higher in the case of on-line users than off-line users.



Results (2)

1) The impacts of IRIS on citizens' trust and relationship with Local Government:

- Comparison of the data obtained from the questionnaires published on-line and those distributed off-line highlights among IRIS users:
 - a generally higher level of satisfaction;
 - a better relationship with the Administration;
 - confidence in the possibility that the reported problem will be quickly solved;
 - a significant higher level in the interest in the problems reported by other citizens.
- One element didn't record significant differences between the two reporting methods:
 - the high level of importance attributed to the participation of citizens in order to improve the area they live in



Results(3)

1) The impacts of IRIS on citizens' trust and relationship with Local Government:

- The association technique was then used considering the highest levels of support:

On-line users - a relationship exists between:

- Willingness of the citizen to improve the area where he lives & willingness to see the problems reported by others;
- Perceived effectiveness of IRIS in managing contacts with the Administration & willingness to see the problems reported by others.

Off-line users - a relationship exists between:

- Willingness of the citizen to improve the area where he lives & willingness to see the problems reported by others;
- Poor satisfaction in the off-line procedure & lack of knowledge about the IRIS software.

Results(4)

1) The impacts of IRIS on citizens' trust and relationship with Local Government:

- In the final question on the questionnaire, some motivations which push users to use respectively IRIS or the off-line procedure are proposed:

On-line users:

- 40% of those responding think that the system helps to save time;
- a much lower percentage feels that it also assures: a trace of one's own contribution, a guarantee of being taken into consideration in a timely manner, the receipt of a reply from the Administration.

Off-line users:

- 26% consider the off-line system as a way of assuring direct contact with the staff of the Administration;
- 20% of those responding think that the system helps to save time;
- 11% of this group of interviewees feel that the off-line system assures cost savings;
- other factors considered to be important: being able to leave a trace of one's own contribution, a guarantee of being taken into consideration in a timely manner.

Results (5)

2) The impacts of IRIS on Local Government's back-office organizational processes:

- IRIS was created for the citizens and therefore the back-office has had to adapt to IRIS rather than IRIS to the back-office;
- therefore the working methods have changed radically;
- the staff reported an averagely low satisfaction in the new working methods (excess of transparency perceived);
- the interaction between the Municipality and its participated companies (public utilities) has not improved since the introduction of IRIS, or at least has improved only marginally;
- the work is facilitated by the possibility of receiving photos with the reports, and to be able to directly contact the citizens;
- low agreement with the following statement: “It is correct that citizens have the right to participate in the improvement of the area they live in, actively reporting all the problems”.

Results (6)

3) The impacts of IRIS on the role of politicians:

- Politicians feel the strengthening of the divide between political level and public management level (the politician now considers himself a “planner” who shows the policies to be followed, while the Public Manager is in charge of achieving them);
- Politicians are aware of the need for a totally innovative cultural attitude. IRIS represents a cultural change within the Administration;
- IRIS produces a disintermediation in the needs, transforming citizens’ needs from favours into rights; the Public Relations Office staff state that this system has led to the disintermediation of needs, the direct consequence of which has been the “decline in the importance of the figure of the politician”

Conclusions

- One choice which has been shown to be winning in the Municipality of Venice is the creation of cheap, rapid access to the Internet, combined with an investment in human resources training;
- IRIS is a totally new system which has demonstrated enormous potential through a great influence on:
 - the citizens;
 - the Public Administration;
 - the political system.
- The Administration must continue to make great efforts to:
 - increase trust, respect and awareness of the institutions among the citizens;
 - promote among citizens interactivity skills, dissemination of detailed information on the activities which use ICT in order to create interest in them and assure that their advantages are immediately recognised.
- The obstacles to the adoption of technologies must be handled one by one to transform them into strengths points, emphasising the safety of using the web and of entering one's own personal data, which is one of the main concerns of the users.

Future developments

- Once the software has passed the introductory phase, it may be interesting to carry out a further analysis to assess its utility compared to:
 - the level of adoption;
 - the variations in the level of digital divide.
- We are now extending the analysis to a sample of European Municipalities in order to confirm a general evaluation framework.

luca.buccoliero@unibocconi.it
elena.bellio@unibocconi.it